Discussion: Non-Contributory Health Insurance and Household Labor Supply: Evidence from Mexico

Gabriella Conti, Rita Ginja and Renata Narita

Discussion by Yuliya Kulikova

4th World Bank-Banco de España Research Conference: Labor Markets: Growth, productivity and Inequality

June 17, 2016



Summary

- Relation between access to public health insurance (Seguro Popular) and labor markets in Mexico.
- Introducing of non-contributory public insurance (2002):
 - redistribution from formal to informal sector,
 - could affect incentives to work in formal vs. informal sector,
 - wage determination effects (if in equilibrium wage adjusts → compensation of the increase in benefits in the informal sector).
- Reduced form estimates: slightly less people are covered by Social Security (due to their transition into informal sector), lower salaries in the informal sector.

Contributions

- An interesting question!
- Household model of wage determination.
 - What are the households that were affected by the reform?
- ullet Structural model o possibility to analyze the mechanisms.

Comments. Data

- Increase in participation vs. switch in sectors
 - Participation rate increased from 59 to 61% between 2002 and 2007 (females 41% to 45%).
 - Moving into informal sector from non-employment increased (especially high educated females with children, as well as low-educated males without children).
 - What are the households that enter labor market/switch sectors?
 - Motivation to enter labor market rather than switch sectors?
 - Could this be driven by the Child care reform in 2007?
- Simultaneity of reforms: is childcare reform an issue?

Comments. Data

- Second-order moments: mean wage decreased, but variance increased quite a bit.
 - Age effects, time effects, change in composition of society (more educated).
 - Variance decomposition: effects of policy change?

Comments. Model

- Labor shocks are mutually exclusive for the members of households.
 - In the US due to assortative mating they are correlated (Heathcote, Storesletten, Violante 2010; Guner, Kaygusuz, Ventura 2016). In Mexico?
 - Identify joint shocks for households?
- Nonemployment: unemployment + out of the labor force.
 - Participation margin is important for females in the US (Elsby, Hobijn and Sahin 2015, Guner, Kulikova, Valladares-Esteban 2016). In Mexico?
 - An important mechanism behind the results.



Comments. Estimation

- Wage distribution is estimated non-parametrically. However, it is truncated (and exogenous) because you observe only accepted offers. Estimated reservation wage is the same for everyone.
 - Do you identify uniquely reservation wage and rate of job arrivals?
 - Usually in partial equilibrium models they could be identified only together (low job offer rate+low reservation wage = high job offer rate + high reservation wage).
 - Transition rates are functions of job finding and job destruction rates
 - Policies might affect reservation wage.
 - Will counterfactual policies be affected?



Suggestions

- Counterfactuals.
- Cost-benefit analysis of the reform.
- Composition of the society has changed over the last decades: a lot more educated people.
 - Result of the reform: people can stay in education instead of searching for a formal job.
- Informal labor sector: self-employed vs. informal sector employees
 - Self-employed differ from individual informal workers.
 - Change in distribution of self-employed and informal employees?